

Effect of Collective Bargaining on Employee Performance in Nigeria Social Insurance Trust Fund (NSITF), FCT, Abuja

BALA Yakubu Ambason

Department of Business Administration,
Bingham University, Karu,
Nasarawa State

Abraham K. Kwaghe

Department of Business Administration,
Bingham University, Karu
Nasarawa State

&

Tony Wuyep

Department of Business Administration,
Bingham University, Karu
Nasarawa State

Abstract

Workers all over the world desire recognition, better salaries, wages and great improvements in the terms and conditions of work. However, in spite of the Government policies put in place including arbitration, communication, third party intervention and negotiation aimed at enhancing organisational performance, some of NSITF employees are still not performing at the level expected of them. The study thus evaluates the effect of collective bargaining on employee performance in Nigeria's Social Insurance Trust Fund (NSITF). A descriptive survey design was adopted; while structured questionnaires were used as an instrument for the data collection. The analysis was conducted using an Independent Sample T-Test. The total population is five hundred and twelve (512) out of which a sample of one hundred and twenty (120) was used. Findings from the study showed that negotiation has a significant effect on the work output of NSITF employees. The implication of this is that negotiation served as a key to corporate performance as it helps to secure a consensus in resolving task and process conflicts by making sure all members understand the reasons behind the compromises made by individual members. However, the study revealed that communication has no significant influence on employee effectiveness at NSITF. The study thus recommends that NSITF management should encourage the use of negotiation (third-party intervention) as a form of a conflict management strategy to boost the work outputs of the employees. More so, the management of NSITF should maintain effective communication channels and explore other ways to improve employee effectiveness.

Keywords: *Employee effectiveness, Work output, Negotiation, Employee Performance, and Collective Bargaining*

Introduction

One of the devices that evolved for settlement or industrial disputes is collective bargaining; and this collective bargaining means the joint determination by employees and employers' relationship such problems include wage rates and wage systems, hours and overtime, holiday, discipline, workloads and work retirement. By bargaining collectively with organized labour, management seeks to give effect to its legitimate expectations that the planning of production, distribution, etc should not be frustrated through interruptions of works. On the other hand, through collective bargaining, organized labour seeks to give effect to its legitimate expectations that wages and other conditions of work should be such as to guarantee the physical integrity and moral dignity of the individual, and also that Jobs should be reasonably secured. The legal climate is one of the principles conditioning the effectiveness and scope of collective bargaining (Nwokocha, 2015).

The major activity of trade unions in most countries became collective bargaining over pay and conditions, with trade union officers also acting to resolve any grievances of individual members, or small groups, within the workplace.

Collective bargaining is an industrial practice made to enhance harmony by the mutual settlement of trade disputes between an employer and workers or their respective unions. It involves a process of consultation and negotiation of terms and conditions of employment between employers and workers, usually through their representatives. It involves a situation where the workers union or representatives meet with the employer or representatives of the employer in an atmosphere of cooperation and respect to deliberate and reach agreement on the demands of workers concerning certain improvements in the terms and conditions of employment. Consequently, two essential conditions for collective bargaining to occur include the freedom to associate and the recognition of trade unions by employers. This means that workers must be at liberty to associate and to join or form trade unions to be able to bargain collectively.

Due to frequent organizational conflict amongst government agencies in Nigeria such as in the NSITF, performance has taken a comparative nosedive sequence. The frequent agitation by workers of NSITF for improved working conditions and other interests have led to a down tool that eventually affects the employee's performance.

In spite of the Government policies put in place including arbitration and negotiation aimed at enhancing organisational performance, some of NSITF employees are still not performing at the level expected on them. The frequent occurrence of disputes in spite of collective bargaining efforts is the problem the study seeks to investigate and to find out why are these employees of NSITF are not performing effectively.

Based on the above-stated problems, the following questions were raised:

- i. What effect does negotiation has on the work output of NSITF employees?
- ii. How has negotiation influenced employee effectiveness at NSITF?

In accordance with the research questions raised, the following hypotheses were tested in null form:

H01: Negotiation has no significant effect on the work output of NSITF employees

H02: Negotiation has no significant influence on employee effectiveness at NSITF

This paper covered the effect of collective bargaining on the performance of Nigeria's social insurance trust fund (NSITF) employees. The period of this study was 8 years, from 2010 to 2017 which is adjudged to be the period when structural reforms were carried out in the public sector. To survey the research, four categories of staff in Nigeria social insurance trust fund, Abuja will be utilized and they are Management staff, Operational staff, Admin staff, and Accounts/finance, staff.

Concept of Collective Bargaining

Collective bargaining has been variously defined as there are many writers on the subject matter. Collective bargaining presupposes the willingness of the employer to settle terms and conditions of employment by negotiation with trade unions. Collective bargaining is a technique by which disputes as to conditions of employment, are resolved amicably, by agreement, rather than by coercion. The dispute is settled peacefully and voluntarily, although reluctantly, between labour and management. In the context of a present-day egalitarian society, with its fast-changing social norms; a concept like 'collective bargaining' is not capable of a precise definition. The term 'collective bargaining' was coined in the 18th century by two British historians of the British Labour Movement to describe the bilateral negotiation process which was later to develop at the close of the 19th century between Labour and Management (Rose, 2008).

Collective bargaining involves a process of consultation and negotiation of terms and conditions of employment between employers and workers, usually through their representatives. It involves the situation where the workers union or representatives meets, with the employer or representatives of the employer in an atmosphere of cooperation and respect to deliberate and reach agreement on the demands of worker concerning certain improvements in the terms and conditions of employment. It defines collective agreement as to the process of arriving or attempting to arrive at a collective agreement (Nwokocha, 2015).

Fashoyin (2011) defined collective bargaining as "machinery for discussion and negotiation, whether formal or informal between the employer(s) and worker's representatives aimed at reaching an agreement or understanding on the general employment relationship between the employer(s) and workers". It can also be defined as negotiation of working conditions and terms of employment between employers, a group of employers or one more employer's organization on the other to reach an agreement. (International Labour Organisation, ILO, 2013). Reaching agreement is perhaps what makes negotiations equal to bargaining. Otherwise, when negotiations go on endlessly without a concrete agreement, no meaningful bargaining could have been struck. Flanders (2016) concentrated collective bargaining as one of the several methods used by trade unions to further their basic purpose of maintaining or improving the conditions of their member's working lives. Flanders further defines bargaining as the process by which the antithetical interests of supply and demand of buyers and sellers are finally adjusted to end in the act of exchange".

Concept of Employee Performance

The success of any organization depends on its employees' behaviour and their decisions towards work. In the organization context, performance is the ability to carry out the job satisfactorily (Armstrong, 2016). Employee's performance involves the use of knowledge, skills, experiences, and abilities, to perform the assigned mission required by their managers efficient and effectively (DuBrin, 2016). It translates into good service delivery and interaction in which affects every area of the organization. To achieve this organization, need to make policies that will encourage employee performance. An employee's job performance depends on or is a consequence of some combination of ability, effort, and opportunity. According to Babin and Boles (2018), employee performance is about directing and supporting employees to work

as effectively and efficiently as possible in line with the needs of the organization. This includes job satisfaction, commitment and perceived psychological contract (Armstrong, 2019).

Various researchers such as Shahzadi, Javed, Pirzada, Nasreen and Khanam (2014), and Frese (2002) have highlighted that employee performance is measured by quantity and quality of output; punctuality at work; helpful and accommodating nature; job effectiveness, helping work colleagues and being a reliable member of the organization; and the timeliness of service delivery and output production.

Conflict Theory

Conflict theory is synonymous with the pluralist or the pluralistic frame of reference which is also credited to Alan Fox who proposed it in 1966. Conflict theory views the organisation as a combination of sectional groups with different values, interests, and objectives. Thus, employees have different values and aspirations from those of management, and these values and aspirations are always in conflict with those of management. Conflict theorists argue that conflict is an inevitable, rational, functional and normal situation in organizations, which is resolved through compromise and agreement or collective bargaining. Conflict theorists view trade unions as legitimate challenges to managerial rule or prerogatives and emphasize competition and collaboration. This view recognizes trade unions as legitimate representative organizations that enable groups of employees to influence management decisions (Rose, 2008).

Rose further states that the pluralist perspective would seem to be much more relevant than the unitary perspective in the analysis of industrial relations in many large unionized organizations and congruent with developments in contemporary society.

The study applied Conflict theory as it engages managers or state functionaries to be tolerant of unions or labor-based political organisations and realize that from the trade unions, the legitimacy of their rule is not automatic but rather the management control function should be shared with labour.

Social Action Theory

Social Action theory is another important approach that contributes to the field of employment relations. This theory sees employment relations from the viewpoint and motivation of the individual. Social action theory perceives the organisation as being comprised of individual

members with divergent goals. The proponents of this theory view organisational conflict as normal and part of the organisational life. Social action theory is credited to Max Weber, a German sociologist. Social action theory is a major contribution of sociologists to the study of organisations. Seniwoliba (2013) is of the view that social action theory seeks to examine how role players take certain actions. Seniwoliba (2013) holds that social action theory emanates from psychological contracts, beliefs, events, and goals of the employees who are part of the system. Seniwoliba (2013) asserts that social action theory is a 'bottom-up approach' where suggestions and decision-making processes begin from the lower levels in the organisation. One of the strengths of social action theory in industrial relations is that it weakens the fatalism of structural determinism. It also stresses that individuals should maintain some degree of freedom of action.

This theory related to this study as it emphasises the individual responses of the social actors in employment relations, namely employers, employees, and union leaders, to a given situation. The proponents of this theory argue that action is "by the subjective meaning attached to it by the acting individual" (Francis et al., 2012). This theory emphasizes understanding particular actions in industrial relations situations rather than on just observing explicit industrial relations behaviour. Discussion of this approach is followed by a discussion of societal corporatism.

Empirical Review

Using Two-tailed t-test and Pearson correlation coefficient together with linear regression employed in data analysis, a study on conflict management strategies used in secondary schools in Kisumu Municipality, Kisumu County by Okoth (2013) found that the conflict management strategies of negotiation used in secondary schools in Kisumu municipality are effective in increasing performance. Therefore, the negotiation was key to corporate performance since it helps to secure a consensus in resolving task and process conflicts by making sure all members understand the reasons behind the compromises made by individual members.

The scope of the study was not mentioned, the tools of analysis used and how it was derived were not stated, but went straight to findings of the study and this makes the study a bit confusing.

A study by Karanja (2015) on the influence of mediation on performance in Kimisitu Sacco Ltd revealed that mediation practices contributed to higher performance and profitability. The study used purposive and stratified sampling techniques in sample selection. Data was collected from study participants using a structured self-administered questionnaire. The study used descriptive statistics to analyze quantitative data using Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) application version 19 while qualitative data was analyzed through content and context analysis. The study showed that most Co-operatives in Kenya have not fully embraced effective mediation that can help them to adapt easily to the ever-changing business trends and compete favorably with other players in the financial sector, hence impacting greatly on their performance and remaining obscure. The study is very weak as it lacks the ingredients to make the study acceptable such as scope, research design employed and tools of analysis used in the study.

Adodo (2015) conducted a study on collective bargaining informal organizations in Nigeria and concluded that the bargaining process represents negotiations on issues in which both the trade union and the management have divergent positions. Primary data was collected through the administration of the questionnaires. Data analysis was conducted through descriptive statistics such as frequencies, percentages, means and standard deviation and inferential statistics used both correlation and regression analysis using the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS). He found that the process is based on the principle that workers have a right to make a contract with their employers with regards to wages and other conditions of service and that the employers recognise that right. Contrary to Adodo's position, Omole, Noah and Powell (2016) conducted a state-by-state analysis of the impact of collective bargaining among teachers on workers' performance. The results of their findings according to the show that bargaining among workers and management does not have any significant effect on the workers' welfare as most agreements reached during collective bargaining are not implemented. They discovered that most union leaders sell out to management during negotiations. In this study, however, the population was not stated, tools of analysis like e-views or SPSS was not indicated and there was no scope of the study.

Nwokocha (2015) examined the role of employers in enhancing collective bargaining in organizations with a focus on private sector organizations in Nigeria. Study data were collected

using a structured self-administered questionnaire. The study used descriptive statistics to analyze quantitative data using Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) application version 19 while qualitative data was analyzed through content and context analysis. The paper exposed some of the factors that undermine industrial harmony and productivity in private sector organizations to include leadership behaviour, lack of effective communication, work environment, and non-recognition of the trade union as a bargaining party. It further explicates that productivity and growth are not fully enhanced because of the management practice of exclusionism, poor labor-management policies, and the dehumanization of the work environment.

The study would have been good if only they have concentrated on aligning the work properly by stating the econometric tools of analysis, the population of the study and the scope of the study and also the components of fiscal policy were not stated. But the findings were well constructed.

Badekale, Ngige, and Hamman (2016) assessed the issues of collective bargaining and employee performance in Adamawa State Polytechnic, Yola, Nigeria. Data was collected through a questionnaire entitled "Industrial Dispute and Teaching Effectiveness Questionnaire" (IDTEQ) and analysed through mean and standard deviation. The major findings of the study revealed that the causes of industrial disputes in Polytechnic include refusal on the part of the management to honour the agreement reached with academic staff and refusal to pay emoluments and allowances of the academic staff.

The study was not properly conducted and lacks proper empirical background. After introducing the topic went straight to results obtained and this is not proper.

Methodology

The study adopted a descriptive survey design in collecting information by administering questionnaires to a sample of individuals. Descriptive research design was used because it enabled the researcher to generalise the findings to a larger population. A descriptive study was undertaken to ascertain and be able to describe the characteristics of the variables of interest in the study.

The population for this study includes employees of Nigeria's social insurance trust fund (NSITF) located in the Abuja branch. The employees have different activities, functions, and services they provide. The total population is five hundred and twelve (512).

A multistage random sampling technique was adopted in the study. The random sampling ensures that units of the sample are selected based on chance and all units have an equal chance to be included in the sample.

The sample size for the study was based on the Smith (1983) formula and it is given as:

$$n = \frac{N}{3 + N(e)^2}$$

Where;

n = sample size;

N = population size;

e = Level of precision required;

3 = constant

In determining the sample size, the following variables were used:

Confidence interval = 95 %

e = Margin of error = 0.05

Substituting into the formula, we have;

$$n = \frac{512}{3 + 512(0.05)^2}$$

$$n = \frac{512}{3 + 512(0.0025)}$$

$$n = \frac{512}{3 + 1.28}$$

$$n = 120$$

Table 1: Sample of Employees of Nigeria Social Insurance Trust Fund (NSITF) in Abuja

S/N	Categories	Population	Sample
1	Management Staff	35	$\frac{35 * 120}{512} = 8$
2	Operational Staff	225	$\frac{225 * 120}{512} = 53$
3	Admin Staff	176	$\frac{176 * 120}{512} = 41$
4	Accounts/Bursary staff	76	$\frac{76 * 120}{512} = 18$
	Total	512	120

Source: HRM Report, NSITF, 2019

The study utilized a structured questionnaire as an instrument for data collection. The questionnaire was administered to the respondents because of its advantage. A five-point Likert-scale which ranges from "strongly agree" to "strongly disagree" (5 = 'Strongly Agree', 4 = 'Agree', 3 = 'Undecided', 2 = 'Strongly Disagree' and 1 = 'Disagree') was used to reflect the agreement of the respondents.

For proper understanding and evaluation of research questions raised and to ultimately achieve the research objectives, different techniques of analysis were employed. Both descriptive and inferential statistics were used to analyze the data collected from the field. The descriptive statistics were used for the analysis of the socio-demographic variables; while independent sample T-test statistical tool was used to test the hypotheses that were generated from the research questions of the study.

The independent sample t-test is given by:

$$t = \frac{\bar{X}_1 - \bar{X}_2}{\sqrt{\frac{S_1^2}{n_1} + \frac{S_2^2}{n_2}}}$$

Where;

\bar{X} = Mean

S_1^2 = Variance

N = Sample

The justification for the use of an independent sample t-test is because it measures the relationships existing between two or more variables. It is simple to compute without errors and it helps to illustrate the directional outcome and strength of the variable. It further shows a precise quantitative measurement of the degree of relationship between dependent and independent variables.

Results and Discussion

Analysis of the Socio-demographic Characteristics of Respondents'

Table 2: Socio-demographic Characteristics of Respondents

Variables	Frequency (N=120)	Percentage (%)
Gender of Respondents:		
Male	86	71.67
Female	34	28.33
Age Distribution:		
17-20 years	8	6.67
21-40 years	49	40.83
41-50 years	45	37.50
51 years and above	18	15.00
Qualification:		
Secondary	29	24.17
Polytechnic/University	69	57.50
Postgraduate and others	22	18.33
Length of service		
Less than 1 year	8	6.67
1-5 years	57	47.50
6-10 Years	41	34.17
Above 10-years	14	11.67
Department		
Administration	8	44.17
Finance	53	34.17
Internal Audit	41	15.00
ICT	18	6.67

Source: Field Survey, 2019

Table 2 above showed that both genders (male and female) were sampled and accounts for 71.67 and 28.33 percent respectively, implying that the investigation was not gendered biased. On age grounds, 6.67 percent of the respondents have their ages between 17-20 years, 40.83 percent are between 21 and 40 years, 37.50 percent are between 41 and 50 years; while 15 percent of the respondents have their ages from 51 years and above.

The qualifications of the respondents revealed that 24.17 percent of the respondents are secondary school cert holders, 57.50percent are Polytechnic/University degree holders; while, 18.33 percent have post-graduate degree holders amongst others. This implies that their responses can be relied upon based on their qualification diverse nature.

Concerning years of experience, 6.67 percent have less than 1 year working experience, 47.50 percent have 1- 5 years working experience; 34.17 percent have 6-10 years working experience, while 11.67 percent have from 10 years and above working experience, as shown in Table 3

The staff department revealed that 44.17 percent are in Administration; 34.17 percent are in the finance section; while 15 and 6.67 percent of the sampled staff belong to the internal audit and ICT department respectively and this, therefore, implies that responses can be relied upon.

Summary of Data on Collective bargaining and Employees performance

Table 3: Negotiation and work output of NSITF employees

S/No	Items	Agreement scale				
		SD%	D%	U%	A%	SA %
1	NSITF has an effective negotiation strategy in place to manage collective bargaining	12.58	23.11	5.19	11.00	48.11
2	Disagreements in NSITF require intervention through negotiation	9.63	17.75	23.53	25.13	23.97
3	Employees want to feel involved in decisions that affect them by negotiating with managers before decisions are made.	17.1	15.5	38.8	24.8	3.9
4	Negotiation has influenced NSITF Performance Appraisal process	38.8	28.7	8.5	13.2	10.9
5	It is important to have a negotiation at the beginning of the performance contract so that an employee is well informed of what is expected	2.9	11.4	12.9	38.6	34.3
6	The resolutions to the conflict are likely to be accepted voluntarily in a win-win negotiation.	4.3	21.4	14.3	22.9	37.1
7	The win-win outcome has a collective bargain and support from affected parties in the negotiation.	1.4	22.9	21.4	28.6	25.7

Source: Field Survey, 2019

Table 4: Communication and Employee effectiveness at NSITF

S/No	Items	Agreement scale				
		SD%	D%	U%	A%	SA %
1	Communication creates understanding and enhances cooperation	7.1	11.4	4.3	37.1	40.0
2	Communication is used in the timely resolution of conflicts in NSITF	5.7	18.6	14.3	11.4	50.0
3	Communication is used to reduce the negative consequences of conflict in NSITF	4.3	11.4	38.6	8.6	37.1
4	Communication in NSITF is a process that contains expressing, listening and understanding	8.0	22.0	8.0	14.0	48.0
5	Communication is an integral part of collective bargaining at NSITF	4.0	14.0	2.0	44.0	36.0
6	Communication is considered a powerful tool in solving performance deviations	6.0	20.0	20.0	32.0	22.0

Source: Field Survey, 2019

Test of Hypotheses

The two hypotheses formulated in this study were tested using the t-statistics. The t-statistics is a test of the significance of the variable used in the regression model; it is used to denote whether the impact of the explanatory (exogenous/ independent variables) has a significant influence on the dependent variable. The decision rule for accepting or rejecting the null hypothesis for any of these tests was based on the Probability Value (PV). If the PV is less than 5% or 0.05 (that is $PV < 0.05$), it implies that the regressor in question is statistically significant at 5% level; otherwise, it is not significant at that level.

Negotiation and work output at NSITF

H₀₁: Negotiation has no significant effect on the work output of NSITF employees

Table 5: Independent Sample T-Test for Negotiation and work output of NSITF employees

Independent Samples Test					
Variable		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances		t-test for Equality of Means	
		F-test	Sig.	T-test	Sig. (2-tailed)
Negotiation	Equal variances assumed	32.14	0.000	8.71	0.000
	Equal variances not assumed			7.106	0.002

Source: Authors Computation, SPSS 24

From regression results in Table 5, the calculated t-value for the relationship between negotiation and work output is 8.71 and the p-value computed is 0.000 at 95% confidence levels. Since the p-value is less than 0.05 used as the level of significance, we reject the null hypothesis (H₀₁) and conclude that Negotiation has a significant effect on the work output of NSITF employees.

Communication and Employee effectiveness at NSITF

H₀₂: Negotiation has no significant influence on employee effectiveness at NSITF

Table 6: Independent Sample T-Test for negotiation and employee effectiveness at NSITF

Independent Samples Test					
Variable		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances		T-test for Equality of Means	
		F-test	Sig.	T-test	Sig. (2-tailed)
Negotiation	Equal variances assumed	14.221	0.000	1.23	0.1923
	Equal variances not assumed			2.19	0.0001

Source: Authors Computation, SPSS 24

The estimates from the regression result in Table 6 revealed that the calculated t-value for the negotiation and employee effectiveness is 1.23 and the critical value is 1.96 at 95% confidence level. This implies that t-calculated is less than t-critical (that is $1.23 < 1.96$) or $p > 0.05$, that is $0.1923 > 0.05$. Since $p > 0.05$, we accept the null hypothesis (H_0) and reject the alternative hypothesis and conclude that negotiation has no significant influence on employee effectiveness at NSITF.

Discussion of Findings

Findings from the study showed that negotiation has a significant effect on the work output of NSITF employees. The implication of this is that negotiation served as a key to corporate performance as it helps to secure a consensus in resolving task and process conflicts by making sure all members understand the reasons behind the compromises made by individual members. This is in agreement with Okoth (2013) who found that the conflict management strategies of negotiation used in secondary schools in Kisumu municipality are effective in increasing performance. Karanja (2015) also found that effective mediation that can firm to adapt easily to the ever-changing business trends and compete favorably with other players in the financial sector, hence impacting greatly on their performance.

However, the study revealed that negotiation has no significant influence on employee effectiveness at NSITF. This result implies that negotiation has not been used to reduce the negative consequences of conflict in NSITF. Negotiation in NSITF has not been a process that contains expressing, listening and understanding which had ultimately influenced employee effectiveness negatively. This is in line with the findings of Nwokocha (2015) whose study showed that lack of effective negotiation undermines industrial harmony and productivity in private sector organizations. Badekale, Ngige, and Hamman (2016) study also revealed that the causes of industrial disputes and poor employee performance in Polytechnic include refusal on the part of the management to honour the agreement reached with academic staff and refusal to pay emoluments and allowances of the academic staff due to poor negotiation.

Conclusion and Recommendations

The findings led to the conclusion that there was a positive and significant relationship between work-output and negotiation as a conflict management strategy. This implied that the higher the

organization adopted negotiation, the more the performance of employees is increased. It was also concluded that the most effective form of negotiation focuses on achieving a win-win situation, which helps improve the general working environment. The study also concludes that in as much as NSITF has an effective communication channel in place, this had no direct influence on the level of employee effectiveness at NSITF.

Based on the findings, the following recommendations were made:

- i. The study recommends that NSITF management adopts an increased application of negotiation tactics to prevent conflicts from spiraling out of control. NSITF management should encourage the use of third-party intervention as a form of conflict management strategy. The intervening party must maintain a neutral attitude to avoid exacerbating the problem. The size of the intervention should be more than adequate to guarantee success. Sensitivity to potential conflicts makes it easy to apply different conflict management strategies within the organization. The overall impact is improved organizational performance because employee morale is high and the cost of conflicts is reduced.
- ii. The findings of the study confirm that there is no positive and significant relationship between negotiation and employee effectiveness at NSITF. The management of NSITF should, therefore, maintain effective communication channels and explore other ways to improve employee performance.

References

- Adodo, D.A. (2015). An overview of the new Labour Act 2005 and its impacts on labour movement in Nigeria. *Paper presented at the conference of Senior Staff Association of Nigeria (SSANU)*, University of Ibadan, Ibadan. June 15th.
- Badekale, A. F., Ngige, C. V. & HammanJoda, I. (2016). *Assessment of the Impact of Industrial Disputes on Teaching Effectiveness of Academic Staff in Adamawa State Polytechnic, Yola, Nigeria.*
- Bureau of Labor Statistics (2008). Glossary, U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics Division of Information Services. Retrieved from: <http://www.bls.gov/bls/glossary.htm>.

- Burke, O. (2016). *Emotional Communication in Conflict: Essence and Impact*. In Eadie, W. And Nelson P.(Eds). *The Language of Conflict and Resolution*, Sage Thousand Oaks.
- Campbell, M. (2010). *Conflict Management within a Local Government Environment*. M.A. Thesis, Potchefstroom University.
- Chegini, L. (2010). *High Cost of Low Employee Morale and Employee Productivity. CFIDS and Fibromyalgia Self- help*. Retrieved Aug. 4, 2015.
- Fashoyin.T. (2011). *Industrial Relations in Nigeria: Development and Practice*. Lagos: Longman.
- Flanders, A. (2017). *Management and Unions: The theory and reform of industrial relations*. London: Faber and Faber.
- Francis, C.A., Ikemefuna, C.O., & Ekwoaba, J.O. (2012). Post-civil war labour policy in Nigeria and its impact on industrial relations: A critical appraisal. *International Journal of Academic Research in Accounting, Finance and Management Sciences*, 2(1), 148-161
- International Labour Organization (ILO) (2013), *Right to Collective Bargaining, Nigeria*.
- Nwokocha, I. (2015). Employers and the Enhancement of Industrial Harmony in Private Sector Organizations in Nigeria. *Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 20 (5).
- O'Sullivan, A. & Sheffrin, S.M. (2013). *Economics: Principles in action*. The Wall Street Journal: Classroom Edition, NJ: Pearson Prentice Hall.
- Rose, E.D. (2008). *Employment relations*. (3rd Ed.). UK: Pearson Education Ltd.
- Seniwoliba, A.J. (2013). Ghana's numerous workers strikes; a cause for concern. *Merit Research Journal of Education and Review*, 1(8), 159-171.
- Yamane, T. (1967) *Research Methods: Determination of Sample Size*. New York, MacMillian Press.